



**NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY**  
**Ministry of Communication, Government of Pakistan**

**FIRST REPORT**

**External Monitoring of the Implementation of  
Land Acquisition and Resettlement Plans (LARPs).**

**CAREC Corridor Development Investment Program**

**Tranche – 02**

**March 2023**

**Subprojects:**

- I. Section 01 : Shikarpur to Kandhkot (Sindh) 62.4 km
- II. Section 02: Kandhkot to Kashmore including Kashmore Bypass(Sindh) 58.800 km
- III. Section 03: Kashmore to Rojhan (Punjab) 38.050 km
- IV. Section 04: Rojhan to Rajanpur (Punjab) 62.74 km

**Submitted by:**

**Ali Ahmad Jan**

External Monitoring Expert (EME)

Cell #: 0300-5355318

Email: aliahmadjan@gmail.com

House 261, Gulshan e Fatima, I-16/1, Islamabad

## Table Contents

<b>1. Lot - I: Shikarpur to Kandhkot (Sindh) 62.4 Km</b> .....	5
<b>1.1 Progress on implementation of LARP</b> .....	6
1.1.1. Crop area.....	6
1.1.2. Private Trees .....	6
1.1.3. Residential Structures .....	6
1.1.4. Commercial Structures.....	6
1.1.5. Community Structures .....	6
1.1.6. Public Structures .....	6
1.1.7. Payable Relocation and Resettlement (R&R) allowances.....	6
1.1.8. Institutional arrangements .....	6
1.1.9. Grievance Redress Mechanism.....	7
1.1.10. Public Consultations.....	8
<b>1.2 Conclusion</b> .....	8
<b>1.3 Recommendations/ Time bound actions</b> .....	8
<b>2. Lot -II: Kandhkot to Kashmore (58.800 km)</b> .....	9
2.1.1 Crop area.....	10
2.1.2 Trees.....	10
2.1.3 Residential Structures .....	10
2.1.4 Commercial Structures.....	10
2.1.5 Community Structures .....	11
2.1.6 Public Structures .....	11
2.1.7 Payable Relocation and Resettlement Allowances.....	11
2.2.1 Land Compensation .....	12
2.2.2 Crops Compensation.....	12
2.2.3 Private Trees .....	12
2.2.4 Residential Structures .....	12
2.2.5 Payable Relocation and Resettlement assistance.....	12
1.1.11. Institutional arrangements .....	13
1.1.12. Grievance Redress Mechanism.....	14
1.1.13. Public Consultations.....	14
<b>1.4 Conclusion</b> .....	14
<b>1.5 Recommendations/ Time bound actions</b> .....	14

<b>3. Lot - III: Kashmore to Rojhan (Punjab) 38.050 km</b>	15
<b>3.1 Progress on implementation of LARP</b>	16
3.1.1 Crop area	16
3.1.2 Residential Structures	16
3.1.3 Commercial Structures	16
3.1.4 Community Structures	16
3.1.5 Public Structures	16
3.1.6 Relocation and Resettlement Assistance	16
3.1.7 Institutional arrangements	18
3.1.8 Grievance Redress Mechanism	19
3.1.9 Disclosure and Public Consultations	20
1.6 Priority Sections of staggered approach for implementation of LARP	20
1.6.2 Land Acquisition and Resettlement (LAR) Impact Free sections (9.502km)	20
1.6.3 Paid off LAR impact section (28.548 km)	20
1.7 Conclusion	21
1.8 Recommendations/ Time bound actions	21
<b>4. Lot -IV: Rojhan to Rajanpur (Punjab) 62.74 Km:</b>	22
<b>4.1 Progress on implementation of LARP</b>	23
4.1.1. Payment of Compensation	23
4.1.2 Institutional arrangements	23
<b>4.2 Conclusion</b>	23
<b>4.3 Recommendations</b>	23
<b>5. Work Plan and Reporting Schedule</b>	24

## List of Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
CAREC	Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation
DDR	Due Diligence Report
DMS	Detailed Measurement Survey
DPs	Displaced Persons
EA	Executing Agency
EALS	Environment, Afforestation, Land and Social
EME	External Monitoring Expert
FGDs	Focus Group Discussions
GRM	Grievance Redressal Mechanism
IOL	Inventory Of Losses
IR	Involuntary Resettlement
LARF	Land Acquisition and Resettlement Framework
LARP	Land Acquisition and Resettlement Plan
MFF	Multi Financing Facility
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organizations
NHA	National Highway Authority
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
PMU	Project Management Unit
PPTA	Project Preparatory Technical Assistance
PRA	Participatory rapid appraisal
SPS	Safeguards Policy Statement

## 1. Lot - I: Shikarpur to Kandhkot (Sindh) 62.4 Km

1. The Shikarpur-Kandhkot subproject is one of the three subprojects being implemented through Tranche 02 project of the Multi Tranche Financing Facility (MFF)-CAREC Development Investment Program (CAREC-DIP). The Shikarpur-Kandhkot subproject carriageway section is 62.400 Km in length that starts at Km 43+400 near Shikarpur and terminates at Km 105+820 at Kandhkot Bypass. The existing road is a 7.3 meters wide single carriageway with a formation width of 13.30 meters that traverses the territorial jurisdiction of four Talukas (sub-districts) i.e. Shikarpur, Khanpur, Tangwani and Kandhkot of the districts Shikarpur and Kashmore in Sindh Province. The cost of compensation to affected people and households along with LARP implementation support to EA is summarized as under:

2. Table 1: Summary of impacts and budget for Shikarpur to Kandhkot 62.400 Km

S. No	Description	Unit	Numbers	Unit Rate in PKR	Magnitude	Total Cost in million PKR
1	Crops	Acre	126	108,584	39.527	4.292
2	Private Trees	No.	1	Various	9	0.027
3	Residential Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft	33	Various	25,915.70	32.665
4	Commercial Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft	145	Various	683,696.60	153.311
5	Community Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft		Various	9,678.22	16.609
6	Public Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft		Various	5,739.34	8.371
	<b>Sub-total structures</b>					<b>215.275</b>
<b>B</b>	<b>Payable R&amp;R costs</b>					
<b>1</b>	<b>For loss of Residential Structures</b>					
1.1	Relocation Assistance	DHs	15	25,000	15	0.375
1.2	Transport/Shifting Allowance	DHs	15	15,000	15	0.225
1.3	Transitional support Allowance	DHs	15	75,000	15	1.125
1.4	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	DHs	15	75,000	15	1.125
<b>2</b>	<b>For loss of Commercial Structures</b>					
1.1	Relocation Assistance (Owner / Renter Operator)	DHs	304	25,000	304	7.6
1.2	Transport/Shifting Allowance	DHs	103	15,000	103	1.545
1.3	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	DHs	78	75,000	78	5.85
1.4	Business Loss Allowance (Owner / Renter Operator)	DHs	304	75,000	304	22.8
1.5	Employment loss allowance	DHs	176	75,000	176	13.2
<b>5</b>	<b>Vulnerability Allowances</b>	<b>DHs</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>75,000</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>1.875</b>
	<b>Total (B)</b>					<b>55.72</b>
	<b>Total of Compensation and R&amp;R Cost (A+B)</b>					<b>270.995</b>
<b>C</b>	<b>LARP Implementation, Monitoring and Administration Support</b>					<b>23.86</b>
<b>D</b>	<b>Contingencies @ 20% of the total cost</b>					<b>54.199</b>
	<b>Grand Total (A+B+C+D)</b>					<b>349.053</b>
	In US Dollar (1 USD=175.13 Pakistani Rupees as of 18 <sup>th</sup> November 2021)				USD	1.993 Million

## 1.1 Progress on implementation of LARP

### 1.1.1. Crop area

3. A total of 39.527 acres of agricultural land in RoW which is being cultivated by local farmers with crops is being affected by the project that will also impact 126 households for which the amount of PKR 4.292 million has been allocated as compensation in LARP budget. No compensation was reported paid by the reporting period.

### 1.1.2. Private Trees

4. A total of nine trees owned by a single owner in RoW are to be affected by the project for which the amount of PKR 0.027 million has been allocated, but no compensation money has been paid.

### 1.1.3. Residential Structures

5. The amount of PKR 32.665 million has been allocated for 33 households to be affected by 25,915.70 sq.ft/Rft residential structures of various categories in RoW by the project. No compensation has been paid and no structure was reported removed during the reporting period.

### 1.1.4. Commercial Structures

6. A total of 145 APs will be affected by 683.696.60sq/ft/ Rft commercial structures of various categories in the RoW by the project. The amount of PKR 153.311 million has been allocated for the people affected by the commercial structure, but no money has been paid so far.

### 1.1.5. Community Structures

7. The amount of PKR 16.609 million has been allocated to compensate 9,678.22 Rft community structures to be affected by the project. No structure was reported paid till now.

### 1.1.6. Public Structures

8. A total of 5,739.34 sq.ft/ Rft of public structures will also be damaged by the project for which the amount of PKR 8371 million has also been allocated in LARP budget, no public structure was reported paid during the reporting period.

### 1.1.7. Payable Relocation and Resettlement (R&R) allowances

9. An amount of PKR 55.72 million has been allocated as relocation and resettlement allowances for the eligible affected people. No R&R allowances were reported paid by the project.

### 1.1.8. Institutional arrangements

10. As per the LARP commitments, NHA has to demonstrate its readiness for implementation of LARP with hiring and mobilization of committed staff along with certain institutional arrangements.

#### *a. Strengthening of Environment, Afforestation, Land and Social (EALS)*

11. EALS is to be strengthened by providing the following staff, but none has been appointed/ hired so far.

01 Computer Operator / Assistant for 24 months.

01 Patwari for 24 months.

Office Support Staff Helper for 48 months.

*b. Establishment of LARU*

12. A Land Acquisition and Resettlement Unit has to be created under PIU with following additional staff:

- 02 Social Mobilizers for 24 Months.
- 01 Qanoongo for 24 months.
- 02 Patwari for 48 months.
- 01 Land Acquisition and Resettlement Expert for 12 Months.
- 02 Patwaris for 12 Months.
- 02 Helpers for 12 months.

13. None of the above staff has been appointed/ hired so far.

*c. Establishment of Project Implementation Unit.*

14. It was reported that a Project Implementation Unit (PIU) headed by the GM CAREC, Sindh section has been established with key staff including technical staff i.e. the Project Director and Deputy Director. The Project Director and the DD land are to be assisted by the resettlement specialist mobilized through the Design and Construction Supervision Consultant. It was also reported that social mobilization and land management staff will be mobilized in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter of 2022.

15. During field visit by EMA for validation of the progress, it was found that no office space was available for the management and staff of PIU of CAREC regional office and sub projects. No social mobilizers and other designated staff including resettlement specialist had been hired.

*d. Resettlement Assistance Disburse Committee*

16. A Resettlement Assistance Disbursement Committee is reported established and notified for processing of compensation claims and disbursement of compensation including resettlement and rehabilitation allowances. This is for entitled DPs of the project according to the entitlements provided in the approved LARP. As per notification the compensation disbursement committee is comprised of NHA staff:

General Manager (CAREC)	Convener
Project Director (Shikarpur - Kandhkot) ADB (Section)	Member
DD (Land) NHA	Member
DD (Account) NHA	Member
Resettlement Specialist	Member

17. No meeting or performance of the committee was reported or minutes of meetings recorded available.

*1.1.9. Grievance Redress Mechanism*

18. A three tier Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) has to be established for the project. As per the proposed arrangements a Grievance Redress Committee has to be established at project level which has not been done.

### 1.1.10. Public Consultations

19. The affected people were consulted during LARP preparation at planning stage, after that no public consultation has taken place for implementation of LARP, nor has any Affected Persons Committee at village level been formed. No communication with affected persons or public at large by the project staff was reported so far.

## 1.2 Conclusion

20. Implementation and reporting of the LARP was actually planned for 2022 which was delayed by EA. However, after lapse of one whole year there was no significant progress achieved by the project management. There was no project office space for senior management i.e. General Manager and Project Director at regional or field levels, neither the required/ committed staff was hired nor any procurement has been done for the project, which showed a very slow start of the project that would certainly lead to delays in project implementation.

21. A quarterly reporting of the LARP implementation through an Internal Monitoring Report (IMR) is mandatory followed by a biannual validation of reported progress by an external monitoring agency. The schedule of internal reporting is not being followed by the project.

## 1.3 Recommendations/ Time bound actions

S#	Action	Responsibility	Dateline
1	Project offices should be established and required / committed staff hired.	GM, CAREC Sindh	April 2023
2	Quarterly Internal Monitoring Reports should submitted with regularity.	PD/ GM CAREC Sindh	Ongoing



## 2. Lot -II: Kandhkot to Kashmore (58.800 km)

22. The Kandkot-Kashmore sub-project carriageway section is 58.800 Km in length that starts at Km 105+820 near Kandhkot Bypass and terminates at Km 164+400 at interprovincial border near Kashmore. The existing road is a 7.3 meters wide single carriageway with a formation width of 13.30 meters that traverses territorial jurisdiction of two Talukas (sub-districts) i.e. Kandhkot and Kashmore of District Kashmore in Sindh Province. As for the final design, existing alignment and ROW limits are followed for construction of 45.780 Km of additional 2-lane carriage way between Km 105+820 to 147+000 and km 160+000 to Km 164+600, while for 13 Km long Kashmore Bypass section (between Km 147+000 to 160+00100) 100-m wide ROW is being acquired. The impacts and budget calculated to clear the available ROW and acquire additional land are given in the following table:

23. Table 2: Impacts and budget for Kandhkot to Kashmore including Kashmore Bypass 58.800 Km

S. No	Description	Unit	Numbers	Unit Rate (PKR)	Magnitude	Total Cost in million PKR
<b>A</b>	<b>Payable compensation costs (Part I)</b>					
	<b>45.780 Km additional carriageway Section (Km 105+820-147+000 and Km 160+000-164+600)</b>					
1	Crops Compensation	Acre	95	108,584	35.866	3.894
2	Private Trees	No.	3	Various	28	<b>0.182</b>
3	Residential Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft	4	Various	1703.9	4.269
4	Commercial Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft	158	Various	269,604.09	121.813
5	Community Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft		Various	6,927.58	11.841
6	Public Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft		Various	3,847.90	7.051
	<b>Total (A)</b>					<b>149.051</b>
<b>B</b>	<b>Payable R &amp; R costs (Part A)</b>					
1	<b>For loss of Residential Structures</b>					
1.1	Relocation Assistance	DHs	1	25,000	1	0.025
1.2	Transport/Shifting Allowance	DHs	1	15,000	1	0.015
1.3	Transitional support Allowance	DHs	1	75,000	1	0.075
1.4	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	DHs	1	75,000	1	0.075
	<b>Sub-total</b>					<b>0.19</b>
	<b>For loss of Commercial Structures</b>					
2.1	Relocation Assistance (Owner / Renter Operator)	DHs	232	25,000	232	5.8
2.2	Transport/Shifting Allowance	DHs	139	15,000	139	2.075
2.3	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	DHs	66	75,000	66	4.95
2.4	Business Loss Allowance (Owner / Renter Operator)	DHs	232	75,000	232	17.400
2.5	DHs with income level below OPL.	DHs	17	75,000	17	1.275
	<b>Total (B)</b>					<b>31.5</b>
	<b>Total (A+B)</b>					<b>180.741</b>
<b>II</b>	<b>13 Km Kashmore Bypass Section (Km 147+000-160+000)</b>					
<b>C</b>	<b>Payable Compensation Costs (Part II)</b>					

1	Land Compensation	Acre	63	1,047,032	362.25	379.287
2	<b>Crops Compensation</b>	Acre	61	108,584	280.370	30.444
3	Private Trees	No.	1	Various	10	0.06
4	Residential Structures	Sq.ft/ Rft	1	Various	1560	2.997
	<b>Total (C)</b>					<b>412.788</b>
<b>D</b>	<b>Payable R &amp; R costs (Part B)</b>					
1	<b>For loss of Residential Structures</b>					
1.	Relocation Assistance	DHs	1	25,000	1	0.025
1.	Transport/Shifting Allowance	DHs	1	15,000	1	0.015
1.	Transitional support Allowance	DHs	1	75,000	1	0.075
1.	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	DHs	1	75,000	1	0.075
1.	Entitled Severe Impact Allowance for Significantly affected owners	Acre	13	108,584	174.75	18.975
1.	Entitled Income Restoration Compensation for Land Loss	DHs	61	25,000	61	1.525
	<b>Sub-total R&amp;R Costs</b>					<b>20.5</b>
	<b>Total (C)</b>					<b>433.478</b>
	<b>Total (A+B+C)</b>					<b>614.229</b>
E	<b>LARP Implementation, monitoring and Administration Support</b>					<b>30.725</b>
1	LARP implementation and administrative support charges @ 1% of the total cost					6.142
F	Contingencies @ 20% of the total cost					122.846
	<b>Total (A+B+C+D+E+F)</b>					<b>767.799</b>
	USD in Million (1 USD=175.13 Pakistani Rupees as of 17 November 2021)				USD	4.384

24. This section has been divided into 02 parts for calculation and payment of compensation which is being presented separately as following:

### 2.1 Progress on implementation of LARP (Part -I 45.780 Km additional carriageway section)

#### 2.1.1 Crop area

25. A total of 35.866 acres of crop area owned by 95 households is estimated to be affected by the project in this section, for which the amount of PKR. 3,894 million has been allocated in the LARP. No compensation out of the allocated has been reported paid so far.

#### 2.1.2 Trees

26. Only 28 of trees of various types are to be removed owned by 03 households. The amount of OKR 0.182 million has been allocated as compensation for trees, but no compensation reported paid till the end of the reporting period.

#### 2.1.3 Residential Structures

27. Four households will be affected by residential structures of 1703.9 Sq/ft/ Rft, for which the amount of PKR 4.269 million has to be paid. No compensation has been paid to anyone affected by residential structures.

#### 2.1.4 Commercial Structures

28. A total of 269,604.09 Sq.ft/ Rft of commercial structures owned by 158 people will be affected by the project in this section. The amount of PKR 121.813 million has been earmarked to compensate the affected commercial structures. No compensation on this account has been paid so far.

### 2.1.5 Community Structures

29. The amount of PKR 11.841 million has been allocated for 6,927.58 Sq.ft/ Rft community structures of various categories and types to be affected by the project. No compensation was reported paid in this category.

### 2.1.6 Public Structures

30. The amount of PKR 7.051 million has been earmarked for compensation of 3.847.90 Sq.ft/ Rft of public structures to be affected by the project in this section. No public structures have been paid by this reporting period.

### 2.1.7 Payable Relocation and Resettlement Allowances

#### a. Residential Structures

31. The only household eligible for relocation, transportation and severe impact allowance affected by residential structures for whom a total of PKR 0.190 million has been allocated was reported unpaid.

#### b. Commercial Structures

32. A total of PKR 31.5 million has been allocated as relocation and resettlement assistance with the following categories of allowances to the DHs affected by commercial structures:

##### I. Relocation Assistance (Owner / Renter Operators)

33. The amount of PKR 5.800 million has been allocated for 232 owner and renter business operators @ PKR 25,000 each as relocation assistance in this section was also not paid.

##### II. Transport/Shifting Allowance

34. The amount of PKR 2.075 million allocated as transport shifting allowance for 139 @PKR 15,000/- each was not paid.

##### III. Severe Impact allowance for Structures

35. The affected households losing 10% or more significant productive assets are eligible for Severe impact Allowance of PKR 75,000/- . A total of 66 such households were identified who lost 10% or more productive assets and were allocated the amount of PKR 4.95 million as Severe Impact Allowance have not been paid.

##### IV. Business Loss Allowance (Owner / Renter Operator)

36. A total of 232 DHs also lost businesses and are also eligible for PKR 75,000/- business loss allowance. Nothing has been paid out of an amount of PKR 17.400 million allocated for compensation of business loss.

##### V. DHs with income level below OPL

37. The DH with income below poverty line (OPL) are also eligible for an allowance of PKR 70,000/- per household. The amount of PKR 1.275 million has been allocated for 17 DHs with income level below OPL. No DHs was reported paid under this category of assistance.

### 2.2 Progress on 13 Km Kashmore Bypass Section (Km 147+000-160+000)

38. Kashmore bypass with a length of 13 Km from RD 147+000 to 160+000 is located at the border of Punjab and Sindh provinces and involves land acquisition for construction of carriageway in accordance

with new alignment. The amount of PKR 433.478 million has been allocated as compensation for damages and resettlement assistant cost. The progress on implementation of LARP in Kashmore bypass follows:

#### 2.2.1 Land Compensation

39. A total of 362.25 acres of land is being acquired for construction of carriageway in Kashmore bypass for which the amount of PKR 379.287 million has been estimated as compensation to pay off 63 DHs. The land is being acquired under Land Acquisition Act 1894 which requires cost of compensation to be deposited in treasury before the process of land acquisition is started. Accordingly out of the allocated cost of land compensation, the amount of PKR 314.313 million has been deposited in the government treasury, District Account Office Kashmore on December 13, 2022 on demand of the land revenue authorities.

#### 2.2.2 Crops Compensation

40. The amount of PKR 30.444 million has been allocated to compensate 61 DHs affected by crops cultivated in an area of 380.370 acres. No compensation has been paid for crops in Kashmore bypass section of lot -II.

#### 2.2.3 Private Trees

41. The only DH losing 10 trees has not been paid the compensation of Pak Rs. 6000/- in this section.

#### 2.2.4 Residential Structures

42. A residential structure of 1560 Sqft/ Rft will also be affected by the project in this section, for which an amount of PKR 2.997 million has also been estimated but is yet to be paid.

#### 2.2.5 Payable Relocation and Resettlement assistance

##### I. Relocation Assistance

43. The amount of PKR 25,000 that has been allocated for a household relocation assistance in this section was reported unpaid.

##### II. Transport/Shifting Allowance

44. The amount of PKR PKR 25,000 allocated as transport shifting allowance for a household was not also paid.

##### III. Severe Impact allowance for Structures

45. The amount PKR 75,000 allocated for the affected household of residential structure was not paid.

##### IV. Entitled Income Restoration Compensation for Land Loss

46. The amount of PKR 25,000/- each has been allocated as income restoration compensation for 61 DHs affected by land loss. Nothing has been paid out of the total amount of PKR 1.525 million allocated under this category of assistance in the LARP.

##### V. Entitled Severe Impact Allowance for Significantly Affected Owners

47. A total of 13 DHs affected by the land loss are also severely impacted for whom PKR 18.975 has been allocated as severe impact allowance for significantly affected land owners @ PKR 108,584 each which has not been paid.

### 1.1.11. Institutional arrangements

48. As per the LARP commitments, NHA has to demonstrate its readiness for implementation of LARP with hiring and mobilization of committed staff along with certain institutional arrangements.

#### *e. Strengthening of Environment, Afforestation, Land and Social (EALS)*

49. EALS is to be strengthened by providing the following staff, but none has been appointed/ hired.

01 Computer Operator / Assistant for 24 months.

01 Patwari for 24 months.

Office Support Staff Helper for 48 months.

#### *f. Establishment of LARU*

50. A Land Acquisition and Resettlement Unit has to be created under PIU with following additional staff:

02 Social Mobilizers for 48 months.

01 Qanoongo for 24 months.

02 Patwari for 48 months.

51. ROW management and mutation support has also been strengthened with the following staff:

01 Land Acquisition and Resettlement Expert for 12 months.

02 Patwaris for 12 months. (Mutation)

02 Helpers for 12 months. (Mutation)

52. None of the above-mentioned staff has been appointed/ hired so far.

#### *g. Establishment of Project Implementation Unit.*

53. It was reported that a Project Implementation Unit (PIU) headed by the GM CAREC, Sindh section is established with key staff including technical staff i.e. the Project Director and Deputy Director. The Project Director and the DD land to be assisted by the resettlement specialist mobilized through the Design and Construction Supervision Consultant. It was also reported that social mobilization and land management staff will be mobilized in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter of 2022.

54. During field visit by EMA for validation of the progress, it was found that no office space was available for the management and staff of PIU of CAREC regional office and sub projects. No social mobilizers and other designated staff including resettlement specialist had been hired.

#### *h. Resettlement Assistance Disburse Committee*

55. A Resettlement Assistance Disbursement Committee is reported established and notified for processing of compensation claims and disbursement of compensation including resettlement and rehabilitation allowances. This is for entitled DPs of the project according to the entitlements provided in the approved LARP. As per notification the compensation disbursement committee is comprised of the following NHA staff:

General Manager (CAREC)	Convener
Project Director (Shikarpur - Kandhkot) ADB (Section)	Member
DD (Land) NHA	Member
DD (Account) NHA	Member
Resettlement Specialist	Member

56. No meeting or performance of the committee was reported in IMR.

#### 1.1.12. Grievance Redress Mechanism

57. A three tier Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) has to be established for the project. As per the proposed arrangements a Grievance Redress Committee has to be established at project level which has not been done.

#### 1.1.13. Public Consultations

58. The affected people along with the RoW were consulted during LARP preparation at planning stage, after that no public consultation has taken place for implementation of LARP, nor has any Affected Persons Committee at village level been formed. No communication with affected persons or public at large by the project staff was reported.

### 1.4 Conclusion

59. Implementation and reporting of the LARP was actually planned for 2022 which has been delayed by EA. However, after lapse of one whole year there was no significant progress achieved by the project management. There was no project office space for senior management i.e. General Manager and Project Director at regional or field levels, neither the required/ committed staff was hired nor any procurement had been done for the project, which showed a very slow start of the project that will certainly lead to delays in project implementation.

60. This section of CAREC Tranche -2 subprojects seems to be more challenging as it requires not only significant land acquisition but also involves Revenue Departments and administration of two provinces. The project team has to be more vigilant and attentive in dealing with the government authorities and other stakeholders. The slow performance and progress show that the project team has not shown such a performance during the last year.

61. A quarterly reporting of the LARP implementation through an Internal Monitoring Report (IMR) is mandatory followed by a biannual validation of reported progress by External Monitoring Agency. The schedule of internal reporting is not being followed by the project.

### 1.5 Recommendations/ Time bound actions

S#	Action	Responsibility	Dateline
1	Project offices should be established with required / committed staff hired.	GM, CAREC Sindh	April 2023
2	Quarterly Internal Monitoring Reports should be submitted with regularity.	PD/ GM CAREC Sindh	Ongoing

### 3. Lot - III: Kashmore to Rojhan (Punjab) 38.050 km

62. The Kashmore-Rojhan sub-project carriageway section is 38.050 Km in length. It starts at Km 164+600 near Kashmore and terminates at Km 202+650 at Rojhan. The existing road is a 7.3 meters wide single carriageway with a formation width of 13.30 meters that traverses through territorial jurisdiction of tehsil (sub-district) i.e. Rojhan of the District Rajanpur in Punjab Province. The impacts of the subproject on DHs and people with cost of compensation is summarized as under:

63. Table 3: Table 3: Summary of impacts and budget for Kashmore to Rojhan 38.050 Km

Sr. No.	Description	Affected DH (Nos.)	Unit	Rate (Rs.)	Affected	Total Compensation (Rs. Million)
<b>A</b>	<b>Payable compensation and R&amp;R costs road Section</b>					
<b>1</b>	<b>Crops</b>	<b>26</b>	Acre		5.7	<b>1.021</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Structures</b>					
	Residential Structures	14	Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	4,089.01	12.651
	Commercial Structures	157	Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	98,349.33	150.34
	Community Structures	7	Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	2,777.36	4.033
	Public Structures	7	Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	2,066.87	5.065
	<b>Sub-total</b>					<b>172.086</b>
	<b>Total (A)</b>					<b>173.108</b>
<b>B</b>	<b>Payable R&amp;R costs in road Section</b>					
<b>1</b>	<b>Residential</b>					
	Relocation Assistance	2	DHs	25,000	2	0.050
	Transport/Shifting Allowance	2	DHs	15,000	2	0.030
	Transitional support Allowance	2	DHs	60,000	2	0.120
	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	2	DHs	60,000	2	0.120
	<b>Sub-total</b>					<b>0.320</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Commercial Permanent</b>					
	Relocation Assistance (Owner / Renter Operator)	156	DHs	25,000	156	3.900
	Transport/Shifting Allowance	139	DHs	15,000	139	2.085
	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	139	DHs	60,000	139	8.340
	Business Loss Allowance (Owner / Renter Operator)	156	DHs	60,000	156	9.360
	<b>Sub-total</b>					<b>23.685</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>Commercial Temporary</b>					
	Relocation Assistance	14	DHs	25,000	14	0.350
	Transport/Shifting Allowance	14	DHs	15,000	14	0.210
	Business Loss Allowance	14	DHs	60,000	14	0.840
	Employment Loss Allowance	-	DHs	60,000	-	-
	<b>Sub-total</b>					<b>1.400</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Vulnerability Allowances</b>					
	Below OPL (6 DHs Commercial & 2 Residential Structures)	8	DHs	60,000	8	0.480
	<b>Sub-total</b>					<b>0.480</b>
	<b>Total (B)</b>					<b>25.885</b>
	<b>Total (A+B)</b>					<b>198.993</b>
<b>C</b>	<b>LARP Implementation, monitoring and Administration Support</b>					
						84.639
	<b>Total (A+B+C+D)</b>					<b>283.700</b>
	<b>Total in US\$ (1 US\$ = 175.48 Pakistani Rupee)</b>		<b>USD</b>			<b>USD 1.620 (million)</b>

### 3.1 Progress on implementation of LARP

64. The PIU of the subproject has reported a total amount of PKR 1.167 million paid out of the total amount PKR 199.000 million payable compensation budget allocated in LARP. The details are:

#### 3.1.1 Crop area

65. As per the LARP assessment / survey a total of 5.7 acres of crop area owned by 26 DHs is being affected for which the amount of PKR 1.021 has been estimated and allocated in the budget. PIU reported that 13 DHs were paid an amount of PKR 0.276 million paid during the reporting period. However, we were also informed that 59 DHs were found missing in LARP who had crops in RoW. The compensation amount for the missing crops has been calculated as PKR 2.025 million. The case for release of payment to additional / new added DHs for their assessed compensation is in process of approval with NHA, HQs.

#### 3.1.2 Residential Structures

66. Fourteen DHs are being relocated as a result of 4,089.01 Sq.ft / Rft structures being affected by the project. No residential structure affected by the project was reported paid during the reporting period.

#### 3.1.3 Commercial Structures

67. A total of 98,349,33 sq.ft/ Rft of commercial structures owned by 157 DPs are also being affected for which an amount of PKR 150.340 million has been calculated and allocated in LARP budget. Only one DP was reported paid PKR 85,353/- against his total compensation mentioned in LARP as PKR 890,951/- The paid amount is 9.5% of the compensation calculated by the LARP consultants. No justification or criterion for this deduction was given in the report or in any other communication, however, during field verification it was found that actually the structure of a cattle shed was located on the other side of the carriageway which is not being affected, therefore not paid for. A tyre repair shop is being affected for which PKR 85,353/- was calculated and paid. The DP Mr. Wafa Hussain was also in knowledge of the fact that the structures mentioned in LARP are not being affected thus not being paid for.

#### 3.1.4 Community Structures

68. A total of 2,777.36 sq.ft/Rft of community structures are being affected by the project for which an amount of PKR 4.033 million has been earmarked in LARP. No community structure was reported paid.

#### 3.1.5 Public Structures

69. The amount of PKR 5.065 has been allocated for compensation to 2,066.87 Sq.ft/Rft of public structure to be affected by the project in this section. However, no public structure was paid for during the reporting period.

#### 3.1.6 Relocation and Resettlement Assistance

70. Relocation and resettlement assistance is being given to DPs affected by residential and structures separately as per following details:

##### a. Residential Structures

71. The total amount of PKR 0.320 million has been calculated as assistance for relocation and resettlement of DHs affected by residential structures as per following details:

##### i. Relocation Assistance



72. Only 02 DHs affected by residential structures were found eligible for relocation assistance in LARP for them an amount of PKR 0.050 million @PKR 25,000/- per DH was allocated. No DHs was reported as paid for during the reporting period.

**ii. Transport/ Shifting Allowance**

73. The amount of PKR 0.030 million was calculated as transport shifting allowance for 02 DHs affected by residential structures @ PKR 0.0150 each in LARP budget. No DH was paid transport shifting assistance.

**iii. Transitional Support Allowance**

74. The amount of PKR 0.120 million was allocated to 02 DHs affected by residential structures as transitional support allowance @PKR 60,000/- each. No DH has been reported paid under this category.

**iv. Severe Impact allowance for Structures**

75. The 02 DHs were also found eligible for severe impact allowance for loss of their residential structures @PKR 60,000/- were calculated. An amount of PKR 0.120 million was allocated in the LARP, out of which nothing was paid during the reporting period.

**b. Commercial Structures**

76. The commercial structures have further been divided into permanent and temporary losses as per the following details:

**I. Commercial Permanent**

77. The amount of PKR 23.685 million has been estimated as R&R assistance for loss of permanent commercial structures under the below mentioned categories of allowances / assistance with following details:

**i. Relocation Assistance (Owner/ Renter Operators)**

78. A total of 156 DPs both renters and owners were found eligible for relocation assistance of PKR 25,000/- each for whom an amount of PKR 3.900 million was also allocated in LARP budget. Nobody was reported paid during the reporting period.

**ii. Transport/Shifting Allowance**

79. Out of the total 157 affected by permanent commercial structures, 139 DPs were found eligible for transport/ shifting allowance of PKR 15,000/- each. The total amount of assistance is calculated PKR 2.085 million out of which nothing was reported paid during the reporting period.

**iii. Severe Impact allowance for structures**

80. The 139 DPs affected by permanent commercial structures out of 156 have been declared severely affected with an assistance of PKR 60,000 each. The amount of 8.340 million has also been provided in LARP budget as severely impact allowance for structures. Nothing was reported paid out of this amount by the time of reporting.

**iv. Business Loss Allowance (Owner / Renter Operator)**

81. All the 156 DPs losing commercial permanent structures have lost their businesses and are eligible for Business Loss Allowance of PKR 60,000/- each which makes a total budget of 9.360 million in LARP for assistance under this head. No such allowance was reported paid under this category of assistance to DPs.

**II. Commercial Temporary**

82. A total of 1.400 million has been allocated as R&R assistance to DPs affected by commercial temporary structures with the following details:

**ii. Relocation Assistance**

83. A total of 14 DPs losing temporary commercial structures were eligible for relocation assistance of PKR 25,000/- which makes a total budget of PKR 2.350 million in LARP. None out of 14 DPs was reported paid relocation assistance during the reporting period.

**iii. Transport Shifting Allowance**

84. The amount of PKR 0.210 million has been provided in LARP budget for transport/ shifting assistance to 14 DPs affected by temporary commercial structures. None out of the 14 DPs has been paid so far.

**iv. Business Loss Allowance**

85. The amount of PKR 60,000/- is being provided to 14 DPs affected by temporary commercial structures as business loss assistance. The total amount under this head is PKR 0.840 million in LARP budget. However, nothing has been paid during the reporting period.

**III. Below OPL**

86. A total of 8 DPs (06 DPs by commercial and 02 residential structures) were found below OPL who are being provided PKR 60,000/- as vulnerability assistance. The total amount of assistance is PKR 0.480 million out of which nothing has been reported paid during the reporting period.

**3.1.7 Institutional arrangements**

87. As per the LARP commitments, NHA has to make certain arrangements for implementation of LARP with hiring and mobilization of committed staff and strengthening of offices.

*i. Strengthening of Environment, Afforestation, Land and Social (EALS)*

88. EALS is to be strengthened by providing the following staff, but none of them has been appointed/ hired yet.

01 Computer Operator / Assistant for 24 months.

01 Patwari for 24 months.

Office Support Staff Helper for 48 months.

*j. Establishment of LARU*

89. A Land Acquisition and Resettlement has been created under PIU with following staff.

02 Social Mobilizers for 48 months.

01 Qanoongo for 24 months.

02 Patwari for 48 months.

90. Out of the above-mentioned staff 02 social mobilizers and one Patwari along with a helper have been appointed/ hired so far.

91. An addition to LARU's routine work, following RoW management and Mutation staff is also required to be taken on board:

01 Land Acquisition and Resettlement Expert for 12 months.

02 Patwaris for 12 months. (Mutation)

02 Helpers for 12 months. (Mutation)

92. None of the mentioned staff for RoW management and mutation has been hired.

*k. Establishment of Project Implementation Unit.*

93. It was reported that a Project Implementation Unit (PIU) headed by the GM CAREC, Sindh section is established with key staff including technical staff i.e. the Project Director and Deputy Director. The Project Director and the DD land to be assisted by the resettlement specialist mobilized through the Design and Construction Supervision Consultant which has not materialized so far. Two Social Mobilizers (one male and one female) have been hired with a helper and a Patwari to carry out field activities. A computer operator is also available from the existing staff strength of NHA.

94. During a field visit by EMA for validation of the progress, it was found that the PIU has been established in an existing office space of Sukkur – Multan Motorway Project located in a Town called Zahir Pir which is accessible to both Lot-III and IV. The vehicles and transport for field staff have also been arranged from other projects.

*l. Resettlement Assistance Disburse Committee*

95. A Resettlement Assistance Disbursement Committee is reported established and notified for processing of compensation claims and disbursement of compensation including resettlement and rehabilitation allowances to entitled DPs of the project according to the entitlements provided in the approved LARP. As per notification the compensation disbursement committee is comprised of NHA's staff:

General Manager (CAREC)	Convener
Project Director (Kashmore - Rajanpur) ADB (Section)	Member
DD (Land) NHA	Member
DD (Account) NHA	Member
Resettlement Specialist	Member

96. No record was available regarding working/ meetings of the Resettlement Assistance Disbursement Committee to review and verify its efficiency and effectiveness.

### 3.1.8 Grievance Redress Mechanism

97. A three tier Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) has to be established for the project. As per the proposed arrangements a Grievance Redress Committee has been notified at project level which has the following composition:

Project Director (Kashmore- Rajhanpur) ADB (Section)	Convener
DD (Land) NHA	Member
LAO Resettlement of Revenue Department (Qanoongo)	
Patwari	Member
DPD/ AD Construction	Member
Resettlement Specialist (Supervision Consultant)	Member
Social Mobilizer	Member

98. As per the mandate, the GRC has to convene its meetings once a month, but no record was available regarding its routine meetings. The only information regarding GRC provided in Internal Monitoring Report was regarding its meeting held on December 19, 2022 wherein 57 applications of claims were discussed and resolved. The GRC approved 34 applications and rejected 23 submitted by claimants. No further record regarding approval and rejection was available.

99. During review and assessment of the claims regarding assessment of impacts/compensation costs for assets not included in inventory of losses, it was observed that the PIU should devise and adopt Standard Operating Procedures (SoPs) for addressing complaints / requests regarding inclusion of assets to avoid frivolous claims. Therefore, to formalize the process for considering such claims it is suggested that the procedure should have the following stages:

- I. **Review** of requests by GRC.
- II. **Verification** by a joint team comprised of surveyors/ patwaris and engineers from supervision consultant and PIU.
- III. **Validation** by a joint team comprised of senior team members from supervision consultant and PIU.
- IV. **Approval** by management / committee.

### 3.1.9 Disclosure and Public Consultations

100. The affected people along with the RoW were consulted during LARP preparation at planning stage by LARP Consultants and later by LARP team of Social Mobilizers and helpers regarding field verification of Inventory of losses. No Affected Person's Committees have been formed at village level, however, the following 02 meetings were reported in IMR wherein 23 DPs participated.

Date	Venue	No. of Participants	Agenda
17/11/2022	Garri Suri Hotel	8	Disclosure of LARP and sharing Policies
24/11/2022	Patti Shah Wali	15	Disclosure of LARP and sharing Policies

## 1.6 Priority Sections of staggered approach for implementation of LARP

101. IU prioritized the 38.05 green field section to hand over the contractor after exhausting all efforts to remove administrative and legal impediment to pay off the compensation for the damaged assets along with RoW. PIU has divided the whole priority section of 38.05 km into the following two categories:

### 1.6.2 Land Acquisition and Resettlement (LAR) Impact Free sections (9.502km).

102. PIU has claimed 9.502 km of a total length to be LAR impact free in various patches of 0.650 to maximum of 2.490 km in length. However, review of the data shows that there are missing DPs whose claims have been accepted by GRC in the sections which were claimed as AR impact free. For example, claim of one Mr. Muhammad Abdullah (S.No 31 of table 3.4 of IMR) at RD 177+700 was accepted whereas the area from RD 177+380 to 178+ 220 (at s.no 5 of table 5.3 of IMR) was claimed as LAR impact free. Likewise, claim of one Mr. Bashir Ahmed (at s.no 15 of table 4.3 of IMR) at RD 185+600 has been accepted whereas the area from 185+350 – 186+000 has been claimed as LAR impact free. Hence, the claims of the claimants in these sections were not found paid, thus the area cannot be considered as LAR impact free.

### 1.6.3 Paid off LAR impact section (28.548 km)

103. A total of 26 APs affected by crops and structures were identified in LARP in the priority sections of 28.548 km from RD 164+600 – 202+60), out of them 13 DPs were reported as paid. However, claim applications of 34 out of 57 new applicants were found correct and included in the list, which has increased the total number of APs as well as amount of compensation cost. Unless the newly included APs are not paid off, the area cannot be considered fit to hand over for construction activities.

## 1.7 Conclusion

104. Despite delay in release of required funds and hiring of staff the progress in Lot III (Kashmore to Rojhan Section) has been significant among other subprojects of CAREC Tranche -2. So far, identified DPs have been paid in the priority section with hiring of necessary staff like social mobilizers, a helper and a patwari. Office accommodation for project staff has also been arranged with vehicles for field staff.

105. CAREC has implemented three subprojects through Tranche -1 out of which two subprojects in Sindh had significant land acquisition and resettlement impacts for which LARPs were prepared and implemented. NHA through relevant PIUs had developed Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) with required forms and formats for implementation of LARPs of tranche -2 projects. The SOPs and formats developed for Tranche -1 subprojects were not extended to Tranche -2 subprojects for implementation of LARPs. EALS section of NHA HQs has a vital role in coordination and linking of subprojects for experience sharing, uniformity and standardization of LARP formulation and implementation.

106. The project team has focused on the priority section regarding reporting of the progress and limited the information. It should be kept in mind that implementation of LARP throughout the subproject is an obligation with reporting the overall progress on payment of compensation, institutional arrangements, grievance redress and consultations.

## 1.8 Recommendations/ Time bound actions

S#	Action	Responsibility	Dateline
1	Required staff should be hired.	GM, CAREC	April 2023
2	Quarterly Internal Monitoring Reports should be submitted with regularity.	PD/ GM CAREC Sindh	Ongoing
3	Record of grievances should be maintained with proceedings of the GRC meetings for reporting.	PD	Ongoing
4	Record of public consultation with proceedings of the committees of APs should be maintained and reported.	PD	Ongoing
5	Record of new APs and avoided/ deleted APs should be maintained and reported in IMRs.	DD Land	Ongoing
6	Database of all APs should be maintained and updated regularly.	GM/PD/DDL	Ongoing

## 4. Lot -IV: Rojhan to Rajanpur (Punjab) 62.74 Km:

107. The Rojhan-Rajanpur sub-project carriageway section is 62.740 Km in length that starts at Km 202+650 near Rojhan and terminates at Km 265+390 at Rajanpur. The existing road is a 7.3 meters wide single carriageway with a formation width of 13.30 meters that traverses territorial jurisdiction of two tehsils (sub-district) i.e. Rojhan and Rajanpur of the District Rajanpur in Punjab Province. The cost of compensation to affected people and households along with LARP implementation support to EA is summarized in the table below:

Table 4 Summary of impacts and budget for Rojhan to Rajanpur (Punjab) 62.74 Km

S. No	Description	Unit	Numbers	Unit Rate (PKR)	Magnitude	Total Cost in million PKR
1	Crops	136	Acre		51.7	9.264
2	Trees	39	Numbers	Various	206	0.794
3	Structures					
4	Residential Structures	80	Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	43,094.21	64.302
5	Commercial Structures	299	Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	151,100.32	226.36
6	Community Structures		Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	5,939.23	8.894
7	Public Structures		Sq.ft/ Rft	Various	2,066.87	3.001
	<b>Total (A)</b>					<b>312.615</b>
<b>B</b>	<b>Payable R&amp;R costs in road Section</b>					
<b>1</b>	<b>Residential Structures</b>					
1.1	Relocation Assistance	55	DHs	25,000	55	1.375
1.2	Transport/Shifting Allowance	55	DHs	15,000	55	0.825
1.3	Transitional support Allowance	55	DHs	60,000	55	3.3
1.4	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	55	DHs	60,000	55	3.3
	<b>Sub-total</b>					<b>8.8</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Commercial (Permanent) Structures</b>					
2.1	Relocation Assistance	365	DHs	25,000	255	9.125
2.2	Transport/Shifting Allowance	286	DHs	15,000	176	4.29
2.3	Severe Impact allowance for Structures	176	DHs	60,000	176	10.56
2.4	Business Loss Allowance	365	DHs	60,000	255	21.9
2.5	Employment Loss Allowance	4	DHs	60,000	4	0.24
<b>3</b>	<b>Vulnerability Allowances</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>DHs</b>	<b>60,000</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>2.58</b>
	<b>Total (B)</b>					<b>57.495</b>
	<b>Total (A+B)</b>					<b>370.11</b>
<b>C</b>	<b>LARP Implementation, monitoring and Administrative Support</b>					<b>24.162</b>
	<b>Total (A+B+C)</b>					<b>394.272</b>
<b>8D</b>	Contingencies @ 20% of the total cost					74.022
	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>468.294</b>
	<b>Total in US\$ (1 US\$ = 175.48 Pakistani Rupee)</b>				<b>USD</b>	<b>2.669 million</b>

108. This summary indicates that the sub-project will impact residential structures/assets of 80 DHs, permanent commercial structures/assets of 176 DHs and temporary commercial structures/assets of 110 DHs. While clearance of ROW limits will result in loss of tress for 36 DHs and 51.70 acres of cropped area of 136 DHs. Furthermore, 231 DHs (55 DHs facing significant impacts on their residential structure and 176 DHs affected by commercial structures) will experience sever impacts. The affected DHS and people will be compensated as per the LARF agreed between GoP and ADB which has to be monitored and assessed under this assignment.

#### 4.1 Progress on implementation of LARP

##### 4.1.1. Payment of Compensation

109. No Internal Monitoring Report or any progress was shared regarding implementation of LARP in this section. On demand of EMA a list of paid APs was shared with names, parentage, CNIC numbers, names of villages and total paid amount with bank cheque numbers. According to details the APs were paid in three phases :

Date	Number of APs paid	Total Amount (PKR)
18-01-2023	7	3,334,645
02-02-2023	18	6,037,275
27-02-2023	17	12,200,227
<b>Total</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>21,572,147</b>

110. Some of the APs in this section met during field verification were also paid for their crops and structures. However, without details about their assets paid and other information the progress cannot be reviewed or analyzed.

##### 4.1.2 Institutional arrangements

111. The GM is looking after all the subprojects of CAREC in Punjab whereas the same Project Director of Lot -III is also in charge of this section.

112. It was reported that the social mobilizers and field staff have been hired separately for this project as the services of staff already engaged in Lot -III have been extended to this section.

113. No information about GRM, Consultations and disclosure was provided for review.

#### 4.2 Conclusion

114. It was observed that CAREC Tranche Punjab management does not think of Lots III & IV as separate projects, therefore, the LARP staff for two of the sub projects has not been hired. Neither an Internal Monitoring Report for Lot III (Rojhan – Rajanpur section) has been written nor database has been managed and updated.

#### 4.3 Recommendations

S#	Action	Responsibility	Dateline
1	Required staff should be hired.	GM, CAREC	April 2023
2	Quarterly Internal Monitoring Reports should be submitted with regularity.	PD/ GM CAREC Sindh	Ongoing
6	Database of all APs should be maintained and updated regularly.	GM/PD/DDD	Ongoing

## 5. Work Plan and Reporting Schedule

<b>Milestones</b>	<b>Deliverable</b>	<b>Timeline of commencement</b>	<b>Dateline</b>	<b>Status</b>
Mobilization	Inception Report	1 <sup>st</sup> month	February 2022	Done
1 <sup>st</sup> Monitoring Visit	1 <sup>st</sup> Monitoring Report	6 <sup>th</sup> Month days	March 6, 2023	Done
2 <sup>nd</sup> Monitoring Visit	2 <sup>nd</sup> Monitoring Report	12 <sup>th</sup> month	September , 2023	
1 <sup>st</sup> Annual Workshop	Report on Workshop-1	12 <sup>th</sup> Month	January 2024	
3 <sup>rd</sup> Monitoring visit	3rd Monitoring Report	18 <sup>th</sup> Month	March 2024	
4 <sup>th</sup> Monitoring Visit	4th Monitoring Report	24 <sup>th</sup> Month	September, 2024	
2 <sup>nd</sup> Annual Workshop	Report on Workshop-2	30 <sup>th</sup> month	January, 2025	
5 <sup>th</sup> Monitoring Visit	5 <sup>th</sup> Monitoring Report	36 <sup>th</sup> Month	September 2026	
6 <sup>th</sup> Monitoring Visit	6th Monitoring Report	36 <sup>th</sup> Month	March 2027	
3 <sup>rd</sup> Annual Workshop	Report on Workshop-3	36 <sup>th</sup> Month	January 2027	
Project Completion	Final Report	36 <sup>th</sup> Month	February , 2027	



### List of people met/Consulted

#### **People met in management**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Position and Organization</b>	<b>Purpose and Outcome of the meeting/ consultation</b>
Mr. Muhammad Azim	Staff consultant ADB	To discuss the monitoring mission and plan.
Mr. Naveed Wahla	Member Aided Projects NHA	To discuss the observations after field visit.
Muhammad Azam Sandhu	GM, Aided Projects NHA	To finalize the monitoring Plan
Mr. Abdul Lateef Mahesar	GM, CAREC Sindh	To discuss the progress, observations and finding.
Mr. Mallah	GM, EALS, NHA	To finalize the monitoring plan
Ms. Amra Riaz	Director, EALS	To Finalize the monitoring plan
Mr. Hanif Pirzada	DD, EALS	To discuss filed visit plan and observations after field visit.
Mr. Jamshed Jaspal	AD, EALS	To finalize monitoring plan
Mr. Sajjad Goraya	GM, CAREC Punjab	To verify the information.
Aun Muhammad Kulachi	DD, Land, CAREC, Punjab	To discuss progress
Ms. Mehwish Ayaz	Social Mobilizer Section 3&4	To discuss the progress
Mr. Abrar Lateef	Social Mobilizer, Section 3&4	To discuss the progress
Mr. Ghulam Yasin	Helper Field, Section 3&4	To discuss the progress
Mr. Abdul Razzaq	Patwari Section 3&4	Database
Mr. Muhammad Imran	LDC CAREC Punjab	Database
Mr. Khalid Saeed	Computer Operator CAREC Punjab	
Anjum Bashir Qureshi	DD Land	To verify the progress
Mr. Muhammad Ali	Resettlement Specialist CAREC 1	To discuss the progress in the field.
Mr. Asif Shiekh	AD Land, CAREC Sindh	To discuss the progress.
Mr. Sanauallah	CAREC Sindh	To discuss the progress

#### **People (DPs) consulted during field verification**

<b>S.No</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Location/ RD</b>	<b>Asset</b>	<b>Outcome of consultations</b>
<b>Section – 3 (Kashmore - Rujhan)</b>				
1	Ali Nawaz Numberdar	195+300	Mr. Allah Dita	Paid

2	Qadir Bux	190+700	Crops	Paid
3	Bakht Ali &Fazal	184+750	Structure	Paid
4	Mur Muammad, Sher Muhammad and Din Muhammad	179_100	Structure, crops	Paid
5	Muhammad Ibrahim	175+100	Crops	Paid
6	Wafa Hussain	172+450	Mosque	He was paid for the mosque he owns. The Tyre puncture repair shop he owns is on the left side of the ROW which is not being affected.
7		164_400	Tube well and crops	The case for compensation payment was under process
8		166+200	Tube well and crops	The case for compensation payment was under process
<b>Section – 4 (Rujhan- Rajanpur)</b>				
9		197+200	02 petrol pumps are missing in the IOL.	
10	Karam Hussain	211+750	Mosque/ shop	Paid
11	Amir Hussain	212+800	Renter of a shop	The shop was constructed after cut off date
12	Faqir Bux	214+50	Chakki (Floor mill)	Missing in the IOL
13	Gul Muhammad / Rahim Bux	227-500	02 shops and floor mill (Chakki)	Missing in IOL
14	Mauladad	242+500	Chakki (Floor mill)	Missing in IOL